

## Chapter X Visual consciousness

### Further reading

(Carter et al 2018, Crick 1994, Dehaene et al 2017, Kanai & Tsuchiya 2011, Koch 2005, Koch 2010, Siclari et al 2017, Tsuchiya et al 2015)

#### **X.1. A non-exhaustive list of possible answers**

(Bogen 2000, Chalmers 1996, Chamberlain 2001, Changeux 2004, Cotterill 1998, Crick & Koch 1992, Dennett 1991, Descartes 1649, Jackendoff 1987, Jackson 1982, Koch & Hepp 2006, Metzinger 2000, Mudrik & Maoz 2014, Nagel 1974, Penrose et al 1997, Searle 1998, Searle 2000, von der Heydt et al 1984)

#### **X.2. The search for the NCC, the neuronal correlates of consciousness**

(Crick & Koch 2003, Goodale & Milner 1992)

#### **X.3. The representation of conscious content must be explicit**

(Crick & Koch 1995, Crick & Koch 1998, Crick & Koch 2005, Fries et al 2008, Haun & Tononi 2019, Lamme & Roelfsema 2000, Singer 1998)

#### **X.4. Experimental approaches to study visual consciousness**

(Alais & Blake 2005, Andrews & Blakemore 1999, Blake 1989, Blake & Logothetis 2002, Blanke et al 2002, Blumenfeld 2005, Blumenfeld 2011, Bogen 1994, Bogen 1995, Bogen 1997, Bonneh et al 2001, Bradley et al 1998, Breitmeyer & Ogmen 2006, Bullier 2001, de Lafuente & Romo 2005, Dehaene & Changeux 2011, Dehaene et al 2001, Driver & Mattingley 1998, Engel & Singer 2001, Engel et al 2001, Fahrenfort et al 2007, Farah 1994, Fisch et al 2009, Frith et al 1999, Gaillard et al 2009, Haun & Tononi 2019, Haun et al 2017b, Kim & Blake 2005, Koch et al 2016, Koch & Tsuchiya 2012, Kolb & Braun 1995, Kouider & Dehaene 2007, Kreiman et al 2005, Kulli & Koch 1991, Leopold 2012, Lewis et al 2012, Macknik 2006, Macknik & Livingstone 1998, Macknik 2007, Macknik 2009, Mashour et al 2020, Mooney 1957, O'Regan et al 1999, Rees et al 1999, Resnik et al 1997, Sheinberg & Logothetis 2001, Siegel & Andersen 1988, Simons & Rensink 2005, Singer 1998, Tse 2005, Tsuchiya & Koch 2005, Wolfe 1984, Zeki & Ffytche 1998, Zhang et al 2018)

#### **X.5. Neurophysiological correlates of visual consciousness during binocular rivalry**

(Andrews & Purves 1997, Attneave 1971, Borselino et al 1972, Campbell & Howell 1972, Crick 1996, Gelbard-Sagiv et al 2018, Koch & Tsuchiya 2007, Kreiman et al 2002, Lack 1978, Lehky 1995, Lehky & Maunsell 1996, Leopold 2002, Leopold et al 1995, Leopold et al 2006, Leopold & Logothetis 1996, Leopold & Logothetis 1999, Leopold et al 2002, Logothetis 1998, Logothetis & Schall 1989, Maier et al 2007, Myerson et al 1981, Rees et al 2002, Sheinberg & Logothetis 1997, Tsuchiya et al 2015, Wilke et al 2003)

## X.6. Desiderata for the NCC

(Baars 1989, Carter et al 2018, Crick & Koch 1990, Crick & Koch 2003, Crick et al 2004, Dehaene et al 2017)

## X.7. Integrated information theory

(Dehaene & Changeux 2011, Edelman & Tononi 2000, Haun et al 2017a, Mashour et al 2020, Mudrik et al 2014, Seth et al 2011, Tegmark 2016, Tononi 2005, Tononi et al 2016, Tononi & Edelman 1998, Tononi & Koch 2015)

## X.8. References

- Alais D, Blake R. 2005. *Binocular rivalry*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. xix, 373 p., [4] p. of plates pp.
- Andrews TJ, Blakemore C. 1999. Form and motion have independent access to consciousness. *Nature Neuroscience* 2: 405-6
- Andrews TJ, Purves D. 1997. Similarities in normal and binocularly rivalrous viewing. *PNAS* 94: 9905-08
- Attneave F. 1971. Multistability in perception. *Scientific American* 225: 63-71
- Baars B. 1989. *A cognitive theory of consciousness*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Blake R. 1989. A neural theory of binocular rivalry. *Psychological Review* 96: 145-67
- Blake R, Logothetis N. 2002. Visual competition. *Nature Reviews Neuroscience* 3: 13-21
- Blanke O, Landis T, Safran AB, Seeck M. 2002. Direction-specific motion blindness induced by focal stimulation of human extrastriate cortex. *The European journal of neuroscience* 15: 2043-8
- Blumenfeld H. 2005. Consciousness and epilepsy: why are patients with absence seizures absent? *Prog Brain Res* 150: 271-86
- Blumenfeld H. 2011. Epilepsy and the consciousness system: transient vegetative state? *Neurologic clinics* 29: 801-23
- Bogen J. 1994. Descartes' fundamental mistake: Introspective singularity. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* 17: 175-76
- Bogen J. 2000. Book Review: A plethora of papyrologic philosophers. *Journal of the International Neuropsychological Society* 6: 366

- Bogen JE. 1995. On the neurophysiology of consciousness: I. An overview. *Consciousness and Cognition*. 4: 52-62
- Bogen JE. 1997. Some neurophysiologic aspects of consciousness. *Seminars in Neurology* 17: 17-23
- Bonneh Y, Cooperman A, Sagi D. 2001. Motion-induced blindness in normal observers. *Nature* 411: 798-801
- Borselino A, De Marco A, Allzetta A, Rinesi S, Bartolini B. 1972. Reversal time distribution in the perception of visual ambiguous stimuli. *Kybernetik* 10: 139-44
- Bradley DC, Chang GC, Andersen RA. 1998. Encoding of 3D structure from motion by primate area MT neurons. *Nature* 392: 714-17
- Breitmeyer B, Ogmen H. 2006. *Visual Masking: Time Slices through Conscious and Unconscious Vision*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bullier J. 2001. Feedback connections and conscious vision. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 5: 369-70
- Campbell FW, Howell ER. 1972. Monocular alternation: A method for the investigation of pattern vision. *Journal of Physiology, London* 225: 19-21
- Carter O, Hohwy J, van Boxtel J, Lamme V, Block N, et al. 2018. Conscious machines: Defining questions. *Science* 359: 400
- Chalmers D. 1996. *The conscious mind: in search of a fundamental theory*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Chamberlain J. 2001. A biologist looks at the study of consciousness. *BioEssays* 23: 297-98
- Changeux J. 2004. Clarifying consciousness. *Nature* 428: 603-04
- Cotterill R. 1998. *Enchanted looms. Conscious networks in brains and computers*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Crick F. 1994. *The astonishing hypothesis*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Crick F. 1996. Visual perception : rivalry and consciousness. *Nature* 379: 485-86
- Crick F, Koch C. 1990. Towards a neurobiological theory of consciousness. *Seminars in the Neurosciences*. 2: 263-75
- Crick F, Koch C. 1992. The problem of consciousness. *Scientific American* 267: 111-17
- Crick F, Koch C. 1995. Are we aware of neural activity in primary visual cortex ? *Nature* 375: 121-23
- Crick F, Koch C. 1998. Constraints on cortical thalamic projections: the no-strong-loops hypothesis. *Nature* 391: 245-50
- Crick F, Koch C. 2003. A framework for consciousness. *Nature Neuroscience* 6: 119-26.
- Crick F, Koch C. 2005. What is the function of the claustrum? *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B* doi:10.1098/rstb.2005.1661
- Crick F, Koch C, Kreiman G, Fried I. 2004. Consciousness and Neurosurgery. *Neurosurgery* 55: 273-82
- de Lafuente V, Romo R. 2005. Neuronal correlates of subjective sensory experience. *Nature Neuroscience* 8: 1698-703
- Dehaene S, Changeux JP. 2011. Experimental and theoretical approaches to conscious processing. *Neuron* 70: 200-27

- Dehaene S, Lau H, Kouider S. 2017. What is consciousness, and could machines have it? *Science* 358: 486-92
- Dehaene S, Naccache L, Cohen L, LeBihan D, Mangin J, et al. 2001. Cerebral mechanisms word masking and unconscious repetition priming. *Nature Neuroscience* 4: 752-58
- Dennett D. 1991. *Consciousness explained*. Boston: Little and Brown.
- Descartes R. 1649. *The passions of the soul*.
- Driver J, Mattingley JB. 1998. Parietal Neglect and Visual Awareness. *Nature Neuroscience* 1: 17-22
- Edelman G, Tononi G. 2000. *A universe of consciousness*. New York: Basic Books.
- Engel A, Singer W. 2001. Temporal binding and the neural correlates of sensory awareness. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 5: 16-25
- Engel AK, Fries P, Singer W. 2001. Dynamic predictions: oscillations and synchrony in top-down processing. *Nat Rev Neurosci* 2: 704-16
- Fahrenfort JJ, Scholte HS, Lamme VAF. 2007. Masking Disrupts Reentrant Processing in Human Visual Cortex. *Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience* 19: 11
- Farah M. 1994. Perception and awareness after brain damage. *Current opinion in neurobiology*. 4: 3
- Fisch L, Privman E, Ramot M, Harel M, Nir Y, et al. 2009. Neuronal “ignition”: Non-linear activation at the threshold of perceptual awareness in human ventral stream visual cortex. *Neuron*
- Fries P, Scheeringa R, Oostenveld R. 2008. Finding gamma. *Neuron* 58: 303-5
- Frith C, Perry R, Lumer E. 1999. The neural correlates of conscious experience: an experimental framework. *Trends Cogn Sci* 3: 105-14.
- Gaillard R, Dehaene S, Adam C, Clemenceau S, Baulak M, et al. 2009. Converging intra-cranial markers of conscious access. *PLoS Biology* 17: e61
- Gelbard-Sagiv H, Mudrik L, Hill MR, Koch C, Fried I. 2018. Human single neuron activity precedes emergence of conscious perception. *Nature Communications* 9: 2057
- Goodale M, Milner A. 1992. Separate visual pathways for perception and action. *TRENDS IN NEUROSCIENCES* 15: 20-25
- Haun A, Tononi G. 2019. Why Does Space Feel the Way it Does? Towards a Principled Account of Spatial Experience. *Entropy* 21: 1160
- Haun AM, Oizumi M, Kovach CK, Kawasaki H, Oya H, et al. 2017a. Conscious Perception as Integrated Information Patterns in Human Electrocorticography. *eNeuro* 4
- Haun AM, Tononi G, Koch C, Tsuchiya N. 2017b. Are we underestimating the richness of visual experience? *Neurosci Conscious* 2017: niw023
- Jackendoff R. 1987. *Consciousness and the computational mind*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Jackson F. 1982. Epiphenomenal qualia. *Philosophical Quarterly* 32: 127-36
- Kanai R, Tsuchiya N. 2011. Qualia. *Current Biology* 22: R392

- Kim CY, Blake R. 2005. Psychophysical magic: rendering the visible 'invisible'. *Trends Cogn Sci* 9: 381-8
- Koch C. 2005. *The quest for consciousness*. Los Angeles: Roberts & Company Publishers. 432 pp.
- Koch C. 2010. *Consciousness: Confessions of a Romantic Reductionist*.
- Koch C, Hepp K. 2006. Quantum mechanics in the brain. *Nature* 440: 611
- Koch C, Massimini M, Boly M, Tononi G. 2016. Neural correlates of consciousness: progress and problems. *Nat Rev Neurosci* 17: 307-21
- Koch C, Tsuchiya N. 2007. Attention and consciousness: two distinct brain processes. *Trends Cogn Sci* 11: 16-22
- Koch C, Tsuchiya N. 2012. Attention and consciousness: related yet different. *Trends Cogn Sci* 16: 103-5
- Kolb F, Braun J. 1995. Blindsight in normal observers. *Nature* 377: 336-38
- Kouider S, Dehaene S. 2007. Levels of processing during non-conscious perception: a critical review of visual masking. *Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological sciences* 362: 857-75
- Kreiman G, Fried I, Koch C. 2002. Single neuron correlates of subjective vision in the human medial temporal lobe. *PNAS* 99: 8378-83
- Kreiman G, Fried I, Koch C. 2005. Responses of single neurons in the human brain during flash suppression. In *Binocular Rivalry and Perceptual Ambiguity*, ed. R Blake, D Alais. Cambridge: MIT Press
- Kullu J, Koch C. 1991. Does anesthesia cause loss of consciousness? *Trends Neurosci* 14: 6-10.
- Lack L. 1978. *Selective attention and the control of binocular rivalry*. The Netherlands: The Hague.
- Lamme VA, Roelfsema PR. 2000. The distinct modes of vision offered by feedforward and recurrent processing. *Trends Neurosci* 23: 571-9
- Lehky SR. 1995. Binocular Rivalry is not Chaotic. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B* 259: 71-76
- Lehky SR, Maunsell JHR. 1996. No binocular rivalry in the LGN of alert monkeys. *Vision research* 36: 1225-34
- Leopold D. 2002. Visual neurophysiology: recordings from the human primate. *Current Biology* 12: R582-R84
- Leopold D, Fitzgibbons J, Logothetis N. 1995. The role of attention in binocular rivalry as revealed through optokinetic nystagmus. *AI Memo Nr 1554 / CBCL Paper 126*, MIT, Cambridge
- Leopold DA. 2012. Primary visual cortex: awareness and blindsight. *Annu Rev Neurosci* 35: 91-109
- Leopold DA, Bondar IV, Giese MA. 2006. Norm-based face encoding by single neurons in the monkey inferotemporal cortex. *Nature* 442: 572-5
- Leopold DA, Logothetis NK. 1996. Activity changes in early visual cortex reflect monkeys' percepts during binocular rivalry. *Nature* 379: 549-53
- Leopold DA, Logothetis NK. 1999. Multistable phenomena: changing views in perception. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 3: 254-64
- Leopold DA, Wilke M, Maier A, Logothetis NK. 2002. Stable perception of visually ambiguous patterns. *Nature Neuroscience* 5: 605-9

- Lewis LD, Weiner VS, Mukamel EA, Donoghue JA, Eskandar EN, et al. 2012. Rapid fragmentation of neuronal networks at the onset of propofol-induced unconsciousness. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 109: E3377-86
- Logothetis NK. 1998. Single units and conscious vision. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London Series B* 353: 1801-18
- Logothetis NK, Schall JD. 1989. Neuronal correlates of subjective visual perception. *Science* 245: 761-63
- Macknik S. 2006. Visual masking approaches to visual awareness. *Progress in Brain Research* 155: 177-215
- Macknik SL, Livingstone MS. 1998. Neuronal correlates of visibility and invisibility in the primate visual system. *Nature Neuroscience* 1: 144-9
- Macknik SL, Martinez-Conde, S. 2007. The role of feedback in visual masking and visual processing. *Advances in Cognitive Psychology* 3: 125-53
- Macknik SL, Martinez-Conde, S. 2009. The Role of Feedback in Visual Attention and Awareness. *Consciousness*: 1163-77
- Maier A, Logothetis N, Leopold D. 2007. Context-dependent perceptual modulation of single neurons in primate visual cortex. *PNAS* 104: 5620-25
- Mashour GA, Roelfsema P, Changeux JP, Dehaene S. 2020. Conscious Processing and the Global Neuronal Workspace Hypothesis. *Neuron* 105: 776-98
- Metzinger T. 2000. *Neural Correlates of Consciousness: Empirical and Conceptual Questions*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: MIT Press.
- Mooney CM. 1957. Age in the development of closure ability in children. *Can J Psychol* 11: 219-26
- Mudrik L, Faivre N, Koch C. 2014. Information integration without awareness. *Trends Cogn Sci* 18: 488-96
- Mudrik L, Maoz U. 2014. "Me & My Brain": Exposing Neuroscience's Closet Dualism. *Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience* 27: 211-21
- Myerson J, Miezin F, Allman J. 1981. Binocular rivalry in macaque monkeys and humans: a comparative study in perception. *Behavioral Analysis Letters* 1: 149-59
- Nagel T. 1974. What is it like to be a bat? *Philosophical Review* 83: 435-50
- O'Regan J, Rensink R, Clark J. 1999. Change-blindness as a result of 'mudsplashes'. *Nature* 398: 34
- Penrose R, Shimony A, Cartwright N, Hawking S. 1997. *The large, the small and the human mind*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Rees G, Kreiman G, Koch C. 2002. Neural correlates of consciousness in humans. *Nature Reviews Neuroscience* 3: 261-70
- Rees G, Russell C, Frith CD, Driver J. 1999. Inattention blindness versus inattentional amnesia for fixated but ignored words. *Science* 286: 2504-7.
- Resnik RA, O'Regan JK, Clark JJ. 1997. To see or not to see: the need for attention to perceive changes in scenes. *Psychological Science* 8: 368-73
- Searle J. 1998. How to study consciousness scientifically. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London, Series B* 353: 1935-42
- Searle JR. 2000. Consciousness. *Annu Rev Neurosci* 23: 557-78

- Seth AK, Barrett AB, Barnett L. 2011. Causal density and integrated information as measures of conscious level. *Philos Trans A Math Phys Eng Sci* 369: 3748-67
- Sheinberg DL, Logothetis NK. 1997. The role of temporal areas in perceptual organization. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 94: 3408-13
- Sheinberg DL, Logothetis NK. 2001. Noticing familiar objects in real world scenes: the role of temporal cortical neurons in natural vision. *Journal of Neuroscience* 21: 1340-50.
- Siclari F, Baird B, Perogamvros L, Bernardi G, LaRocque JJ, et al. 2017. The neural correlates of dreaming. *Nature Neuroscience* 20: 872-78
- Siegel RM, Andersen RA. 1988. Perception of three-dimensional structure from motion in monkey and man. *Nature* 331: 259-61
- Simons DJ, Rensink RA. 2005. Change blindness: past, present, and future. *Trends Cogn Sci* 9: 16-20
- Singer W. 1998. Consciousness and the structure of neuronal representations. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London Series B* 353: 1829-40
- Tegmark M. 2016. Improved Measures of Integrated Information. *PLoS Comput Biol* 12: e1005123
- Tononi G. 2005. Consciousness, information integration, and the brain. *Prog Brain Res* 150: 109-26
- Tononi G, Boly M, Massimini M, Koch C. 2016. Integrated information theory: from consciousness to its physical substrate. *Nat Rev Neurosci* 17: 450-61
- Tononi G, Edelman G. 1998. Neuroscience - Consciousness and complexity. *Science* 282: 1846-51
- Tononi G, Koch C. 2015. Consciousness: here, there and everywhere? *Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological sciences* 370
- Tse PU, Martinez-Conde S, Shlegel, A.A., Macknik, S.L. 2005. Visibility, visual awareness, and visual masking of simple unattended targets are confined to areas in the occipital cortex beyond human V1/V2. *PNAS* 102: 17178-83
- Tsuchiya N, Koch C. 2005. Continuous flash suppression reduces negative afterimages. *Nature Neuroscience* 8: 1096-101
- Tsuchiya N, Wilke M, Frassle S, Lamme VAF. 2015. No-Report Paradigms: Extracting the True Neural Correlates of Consciousness. *Trends Cogn Sci* 19: 757-70
- von der Heydt R, Peterhans E, Baumgartner G. 1984. Illusory contours and cortical neuron responses. *Science* 224: 1260-62
- Wilke M, Logothetis NK, Leopold DA. 2003. Generalized flash suppression of salient visual targets. *Neuron* 39: 1043-52
- Wolfe J. 1984. Reversing ocular dominance and suppression in a single flash. *Vision research* 24: 471-78
- Zeki S, Ffytche DH. 1998. The Riddoch syndrome: insights into the neurobiology of conscious vision. *Brain : a journal of neurology* 121: 25-45

Zhang M, Feng J, Ma KT, Lim JH, Zhao Q, Kreiman G. 2018. Finding any Waldo: zero-shot invariant and efficient visual search. *Nature Communications* 9: 3730